

Peer Review Summary Document

(10/23/18)

Peer Review Plan

https://www2.usgs.gov/peer_review/docs/conservation_challenges_free_roaming_horses.pdf [20 KB PDF].

Title and Authorship of Information Product Disseminated

Conservation challenges emerging from free-roaming horse management: a vexing social-ecological mismatch, By Erik A. Beever, Lynn Huntsinger, and Steven Petersen.

Peer Reviewers Expertise and Credentials

Reviewer #1 is a Senior Program Officer at the National Academies of Science (NAS) whose work has included directing consensus studies on the use of science in the Bureau of Land Management's (BLM) Wild Horse and Burro Program.

Reviewer #2 is a USGS Ecologist who previously worked for the BLM on multiple-use management including restoration, planning and assessment, renewable energy development, resource management planning and conservation biology across western sage-steppe and grassland ecosystems.

Reviewer #3 is a USGS Research Ecologist with over 25 years of experience in work on landscape ecology in the western United States, including development of vegetation monitoring protocols to quantify habitat quality and change in response to natural-resource management actions and land use.

Charge Submitted to Peer Reviewers

The reviewers were asked to make an objective evaluation of the research.

Summary of Peer Reviewers Comments

The reviewers overall gave generally positive evaluations of the manuscript. Each reviewer made suggested in-text modifications for consideration, and provided various comments, for example questions about the balance of United States versus international focus area; recommendations for deleting some text they thought was not needed; addition of text to the Supplemental Material and references; and clarification of certain statements. One reviewer also requested that additional text on how frequently appropriate management levels were adjusted, left unchanged, or established be included.

Summary of USGS Response to Peer Reviewers Comments

In response to the reviewers comments, the authors incorporated most of suggested changes and recommended deletions and additions in the various section of the manuscript as deemed appropriate. With regard to the focus area, no changes were made, given explicit instructions provided earlier by the journal's Editor-in-Chief.

The Dissemination

The published information product will be released by the journal *Biological Conservation*.